DEFENCE OF DISSERTATIONS AT THE SCHOOL OF ECONOMICS AND BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION OF THE UNIVERSITY OF TARTU: PRINCIPAL, TECHNICAL AND PROCEDURAL RULES

Adopted based on:
- Procedure for Awarding Doctorates of the University of Tartu
- Study Regulations of the University of Tartu
- Procedure for Publication of Graduation Theses and Dissertations of the University of Tartu

In the event of violation of the rules of application for and awarding of doctorates, the applicant for a doctorate may file an appeal against a decision of the Council with the Vice Rector for Academic Affairs. The decision to make an exception from the Procedure belongs under the exclusive competence of the council of a school.

1. REQUIREMENTS OF DISSERTATION

1.1. Dissertations defended at the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration must meet the requirements of the University of Tartu by presenting an original approach in theory, methodological and/or empirical analysis. A dissertation is an independent research paper that presents a well-argued, original solution to a specific scientific problem and whose results are published in international professional literature.

1.2. A dissertation must contain the following:
- an overview of the current situation of the field of research and the position of the research problem therein;
- the formulation of the research task;
- the statements presented for defence;
- a description of the methodology;
- the course and proof of the resolution of the research task;
- a summary;
- a list of references;
- an exhaustive Estonian summary of various parts of the paper if the dissertation has been written in a foreign language or an exhaustive foreign-language summary of various parts of the paper if the dissertation has been written in Estonian;
1.3. Summary of the dissertation should contain the following:

1) General overview of the research
   • overview of the research problem and topicality;
   • purpose of research and research questions and research gap;
   • research topic (research matter, outlining of the research problem);
   • originality of the research (theoretical, empirical and methodological originality);

2) Structure and content of research
   • theoretical background;
   • presented research arguments;
   • research methodology and source material used;
   • results of analysis and conclusions, including the practical importance of research
   • suggestions for further research

1.4. A dissertation can be defended in formats set out in section 15 of the Procedure for Awarding Doctorates (monograph or on the basis of articles), this procedure sets out minimum requirements.

2. FORMALISING OF DISSERTATION

A. An independent research-paper published in the University’s dissertation series (dissertationes)
Dissertation formalised as an independent research is an integral research of the applicant for a doctorate binding together the results of the scientific work so far. The chapters have to be in coherence with each other and make up a whole. Introduction and summary have to include the same elements as the research-papers of lower level students.

It is necessary that the applicant for a doctorate presenting dissertation in such format has by the date of the pre-defence had at least one publication previously published or accepted for publication in scientific journals or collections corresponding to the classifiers of the Estonian Research Portal sections 1.1, 1.2, 3.1 (www.etis.ee)

B. A series of publications along with a summarising article published in the University’s dissertation series
Precondition for defence is at least three published articles or articles accepted for publication, which are published in journals according to ETIS classifications under categories 1.1, 1.2. A chapter in the publication of a monograph by renowned research publishing houses (ETIS 3.1.) is deemed equal to the publication of an article. Summarising review article that complies with the requirements set out in clause 1.2. is added to articles.

Articles should be bound together under single covers; if possible, the layout requirements for dissertations should be followed (unless journals require using their own layout). Issues with copyright in regards to republishing articles published in journals shall be solved by the author of
dissertation. In addition to the conventional items, the introduction or summarising article (which is longer from a “traditional” introduction) must bring out the following:

- For articles published in co-authorship, specific contribution of the applicant for a doctorate in the completion thereof must be indicated;
- Theoretical frame of reference that ties different publications together.

The summary of dissertation has to bind the findings and results of different articles together into one whole unit.

C. A monograph published abroad
A monograph published by an internationally renowned research publishing house written single-handedly. Previous publishing of results in other format is not requested. Monograph must be submitted for defence along with summary article described in section 1.3.

3. TECHNICAL RULES OF DISSERTATION

3.1. The formalising guide specified by the University of Tartu Press must be followed in the technical formalising of dissertation (http://www.tyk.ee/doctoral-theses-1).

3.2. Dissertation is written either in a foreign language (English is preferred) or in Estonian. The information on the cover of dissertation is given in annex 1. The excerpt from the decision of the council of the faculty is marked on the overleaf of the title page (example of overleaf of title page is given in annex 2) as well as:
- Supervisor(s);
- Opponents;
- Time and place of defence;
- Contribution of the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration for publishing of dissertation, requisites of publishing house and copyright information.

4. PROCEDURE FOR APPLYING FOR DOCTORATE

4.1 Pre-defence
Pre-defence of dissertation is held before allowing dissertation for defence. The applicant for doctorate has to submit a preliminary version of the work to the Dean’s Office. Dissertation must include all the elements (except Curriculum vitae and resume). Council for pre-defence will be formed separately for each defence of dissertation. The Council for pre-defence has at least five members and constituents of PhD researchers of the respective field. Programme Director is in charge of organising the Council and the constitution is set by directive of the Dean. At least two opponents oppose dissertation in pre-defence, of which one must be an acknowledged researcher from outside the University of Tartu. Opponents are members of the Council for pre-defence. The dissertation has to be accessible electronically seven days before pre-defence to the Council of pre-defence and faculty members. A discussion of the content of dissertation takes place on
pre-defence, where applicant for doctorate receives suggestions for eliminating the shortcomings and mistakes in the work and the conformity to the requirements of dissertation is decided upon. One of the following decisions is made on pre-defence:

- Allow the dissertation to be defended. By the given decision, the Council for pre-defence confirms that the dissertation qualifies to the principal and formal rules of doctoral thesis.
- In the event of small deficiencies, demand that the dissertation be reformulated and corrected. After corrections have been made, the opponents assess the corrections and Council for pre-defence makes a new decision based on recommendation of opponents to allow the dissertation to be defended or to reject the dissertation.
- In the event of large deficiencies, demand that the dissertation be reformulated and corrected. After corrections have been made, the opponents assess the corrections and Council for pre-defence makes a new decision based on recommendation of opponents to allow the dissertation to be defended or to reject the dissertation.
- Not to allow the dissertation to be defended. An evaluation is given that the pre-defence was not a success; dissertation does not qualify for the principal and formal rules of doctoral thesis. The applicant for doctorate may reinstate the defence procedure of dissertation in the future, including submitting a renewed dissertation to the Dean’s Office, forming a new Council for pre-defence and new pre-defence.

4.2. Preconditions for allowing dissertation for defence
The council of a faculty adopts a decision about allowing the dissertation to be defended. The precondition for allowing dissertation to be defended is the completion of doctoral curriculum of the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration of the University of Tartu to the extent required in the Study Regulations. In case the person has not completed the doctoral curriculum or has completed it in part (partially in another doctoral curriculum), the council of faculty decides on the accordance of the curriculum completed elsewhere to the requirements of doctoral curriculum of the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration and in case of accordance gives permission to initiate the defence procedure.

4.3. Documents required for allowing dissertation to be defended
Applicant for a doctorate, having made corrections and reformulations recommended on the pre-defence, forms the final version of dissertation and submits the following documents to the Secretary of the Council of the faculty (electronically):

- an application to allow the applicant to defend their dissertation, specifying the exact title of the doctorate applied for;
- the manuscript of the dissertation, which complies with the requirements established for manuscripts by Tartu University Press;
- a curriculum vitae that contains a list of research publications
- (a) written opinion(s) of the supervisor(s) about dissertation
- a brief popular science summary (up to 2000 characters) in Estonian and English, which is aimed at a broad audience.

4.4. Submission of dissertation to the Academic Secretary
The Secretary of Council will, within three working days of receipt of the documents specified in section 4.3 send them to the Academic Secretary, who will assess the formal compliance of the
submitted materials with the requirements of the Procedure, involving experts therein, where necessary. The responsible person for compliance of the submitted materials sent to the Academic Secretary is the supervisor of dissertation.

The Academic Secretary shall, within five working days submit their written stand to the council.

4.5. Allowing dissertation to be defended and appointing of opponents
Within six weeks of receipt of the documents submitted by the applicant, the Council will make one of the following decisions: (1) allow the dissertation to be defended; (2) reject the dissertation; (3) submit the dissertation for a pre-review.

If the Council decides to allow a dissertation to be defended, the Council simultaneously appoints the opponent(s) of the dissertation, the time and place of defence and additional members of the Council.

The dissertation should have at least two recognised opponents of the respective field: one opponent from Estonia and one outside Estonia, to assure compliance of dissertation to international standards. It is assumed that the applicant for a doctorate does not have joint publications with the opponent or the opponent does not have a conflict of interests with the applicant for a doctorate in performing the task.

Three opponents are also permitted; similarly, all the opponents can be from outside Estonia. Opponents will be appointed as additional members of Council.

The decision to allow the dissertation for defence will be minuted by the Secretary of Council.

4.6. Publishing of dissertation and distribution of information
After the dissertation has been allowed for defence, the applicant for a doctorate will submit the manuscript and a short summary compiled with a popular scientific purpose and meant for wider audience to the Tartu University Press for publishing at least seven weeks before date of defence and the Dean’s Office will send the decision of the Council on allowing the dissertation for defence to the Tartu University Press.

Dissertation must be available for reviewing in print at the University Library and electronically on the library webpage at least one month before defence, except in case the defence of dissertation has been declared private and/or there are restrictions established on the publication of the dissertation.

The applicant for doctorate will submit 20 printed copies of dissertation and informational letter (Word file one A4 page) to the Secretary of Council and will deliver dissertation to the opponents. Head of Chair and supervisor are responsible that the written opinions of both opponents have been submitted to the Secretary of Council at least three days before defence.
The Secretary of Council will send the printed dissertation and informational letter to the members of Council and defence will be published on the faculty webpage.

Proofreading of dissertation will be covered from the Dean’s Office funds in the extent of 1278 euros. The invoice will be paid after pre-defence of dissertation.

4.7. Defence of dissertation
A defence of a dissertation takes place at a meeting of the Council of the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration as a public academic discussion, the meeting is led by the Dean (or Vice-Dean). The meeting is minuted by the Council secretary. The public defence of dissertation at the meeting of the Council (except private adopting of decision of the Council) is recorded as a sound recording and is retained according to the order of University of Tartu. The Council is competent if at least six members of the Council with decision-making authority are present. A defence can only take place if the applicant for a doctorate, opponents (at least one on the spot and other(s) via electronic media, i.e. Skype) and desirably, at least one of the supervisors are present. If a dissertation contains a state secret, trade secret or other classified information, the Rector may, on the proposal of the Council, declare the meeting private. The sound recording will have restricted access if the meeting is declared private.

A defence consists of the following parts:

- introduction;
- presentation by the applicant (*lectio praecursoria*), (up to 30 minutes);
- remarks by the opponent(s);
- academic discussion between the applicant and the opponents;
- academic discussion in the presence of the members of the Council and the attendees (if wished, can be combined with remarks of the opponent(s));
- remarks, comments
- remarks of the supervisor(s)
- final remarks of the applicant.
- adoption of the decision of the Council;
- declaration of the decision of the Council;

In a closed discussion (involving the members of the Council, opponents and supervisors who do not have the right to vote), the Council will discuss the applicant’s presentation and ability to defend the main statements of the dissertation in the discussion. Considering the assessments of the opponent(s) regarding the dissertation and discussion, the Council will, in a public vote, make one of the following decisions, which will be minuted:

1. The dissertation was defended successfully (grade: ‘defended’). To award a doctorate to the applicant.
2. The dissertation was not defended successfully (grade: ‘not defended’). Not to award a doctorate to the applicant.
3. Not to make a decision due to suspicion of plagiarism or academic fraud. To send the dissertation to experts for assessment.

If the Council decides not to award a doctorate to an applicant, the applicant will be entitled to apply for a repeat defence of the same dissertation once within the time limit set by the Council.

5. CONTESTATION OF AND OVERTURNING OF DECISIONS

In the event of a violation of the rules of application for and awarding of doctorates, the applicant for a doctorate may file an appeal against a decision of the Council with the Vice Rector for Academic Affairs within one week of the day following the announcement of the decision of the Council. The Appeal Committee will make a decision within 30 days of the submission of the appeal. This decision of the Appeal Committee is not subject to appeal in the University.

In the event of reasonable doubt of plagiarism or academic fraud submitted to the Council in written form, the Council has the right to overturn their decision. In case the applicant for a degree has been deleted from the matriculation register due to academic fraud or the decision to award a doctorate has been overturned, the applicant for a doctorate has to submit a new dissertation in accordance with section 19 of the Procedure for Awarding Doctorates in order to receive a doctorate from the University of Tartu.
RUTH ALAS

Organisational changes during the transition in Estonia:
major influencing behavioral factors
Lisa 2
Example of title page overleaf

The Faculty of Economics and Business Administration, the University of Tartu, Estonia

This dissertation is accepted for the defense of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (in Economics) on 20. Oct. 2004 by the Council of the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration, the University of Tartu.

Supervisor: Professor Maaja Vadi (Ph.D), University of Tartu, Estonia

Opponents: Professor Kari Lilja (Ph.D), Helsinki School of Economics and Business Administration, Finland.

Professor Harry Roots (Ph.D), Tallinn Pedagogical University, Estonia

The public defense of the dissertation is on December 22nd 2004 at 14.00 in room B306, Narva Rd. 4, Oeconomicum, the University of Tartu.

The publication of this dissertation is granted by the Faculty of Economics and Business Administration, the University of Tartu.